

The NYMAS REVIEW

A Publication of the New York Military Affairs Symposium

Annual Civil War Special Issue

No. 40, Spring 2007

Copyright© 2007 NYMAS & the Authors

A Note from the Editor

To better serve the needs of our members, we've shifted the annual Civil War special issue of *The Review* from Summer to Spring.

Feature Review

Plenty of Blame to Go Around: J.E.B. Stuart's Controversial Ride to Gettysburg
by Eric J. Wittenberg and J.D. Petruzzi.

As a student of the American Civil War, one of the most discussed topics and the most asked questions I have come across is why new books continue to come out on Gettysburg? What else can be said about Lee's second march North?

The answer I give is "plenty," and that answer is aptly supported by the new book from Eric J. Wittenberg and J.D. Petruzzi. *Plenty of Blame To Go Around* tells the tale of just what those in J.E.B. Stuart's cavalry were doing during the Gettysburg Campaign. Opening as the Army of Northern Virginia moves across the Potomac River in June of 1863, the authors take us along with Stuart's troopers as they follow the path that, after many adventures, eventually brought them to the battlefield at Gettysburg. Along the way, we learn about the hardships of the long days and nights sitting in the saddle. The authors provide full accounts of each battle that occurred on that long ride through hostile territory. The fights at Westminister, Hanover, Carlisle, and Hunterstown are thoroughly explained, and accounts by those who served in the ranks during those fights add to the value of the book, showing that us that Stuart and his boys had a very rough time and that their ride around the Army of the Potomac was nothing like the rides they had undertaken earlier in the war.

An added feature is that the authors have provided a look at how the troopers kept their horses in the best possible condition during the arduous ride. They also give us a look at some of the overlooked results of the ride. When Stuart finally joined the main body of the army on July 2nd, with a long train of captured wagons in tow, Lee is famously supposed to have said that they were of no use to him. Well, in fact, they were of major use; it was by using those captured wagons that Lee was able to evacuate most of his wounded after the three-day battle was over. And the mobile forges among the captured wagons were of immense help to the horses of Lee's army, many in need of shoeing

after weeks of hard service. So one can see why Stuart thought his prizes were of great value.

In their conclusions, the authors provide a very good discussion of the arguments regarding responsibility – "blame" – for the ride and its effects on the campaign. This is a fine way to end the book, as it opens avenues for further discussion of the events.

The work includes four appendices that plainly show how much heat he was getting because of his "so called" joy ride (there was no joy in that "joy ride") and guidance for touring the field by car.

There are numerous illustrations taken from period literature, most notably portraits of many of the leading participants, and a great many maps to help the reader to follow events as they unfolded. In reading *Plenty of Blame to Go Around*, be sure not to miss the preface, forward, introduction, and footnotes, which include some thoughtful comments and observations, not to mention many fine nuggets of information.

For more information, the authors have a web site for the book at www.stuartside.com

An excellent book, highly recommend.

--Steve Basic

Plenty of Blame to Go Around: J.E.B. Stuart's Controversial Ride to Gettysburg, by Eric J. Wittenberg and J.D. Petruzzi. New York: Savas Beatty, 2006. Pp. xvii, 428. Illus., maps, append, notes, biblio., index. \$32.95. ISBN: 1-932714-20-0.

Visit the NYMAS Website

nymas.org

Bob Rowen, Webmaster

The Naval War

Blue & Gray Navies: The Civil War Afloat, by Spencer C. Tucker. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 2006. Pp. xxviii, 429. Illus., maps, gloss., notes, biblio., index. \$34.95. ISBN: 1-59114-882-0.

A fresh look at the maritime war stressing the operational side. Author of a number of other works on the Civil War, Tucker is even-handed, giving credit where credit is due, but also critical where criticism is needed. Opening with a short, but solid look at the institutional, organizational, and technological background, he provides an overview of the strategies of the two navies, and then plunges right into operations, devoting the

bulk of the work to them. The work includes a particularly valuable look at the blockade and blockade running, as well as solid treatments of the introduction of ironclads and “unconventional weapons,” including a few surprises even for the seasoned student of the war. Among the more interesting ideas discussed is that Union success in many joint operations was partially a result of ties of friendship that were built between naval and army commanders. A worthwhile read for anyone interested in the maritime war.

Clyde Built Blockade Runners, Cruisers, and Armoured Rams of the American Civil War, by Eric J. Graham. Edinburg: Birlinn Limited/Drexel Hill, Pa.: Casemate, 2006. Pp. xvii, 238. Illus., maps, append., biblio., index. \$34.95. ISBN: 1-84158-424-X.

A look at the surprisingly important role that Scottish shipyards, particularly those along the Clyde, had in the Civil War at sea, building or outfitting commerce raiders, blockade runners, and warships for the Confederacy. Along the way, the book provides insights into the ship-building industry, the complexities of Britain’s neutrality laws and the ways they could be evaded, the business of blockade running, and more besides, such as Jules Verne or the support given by expatriate Black Americans in Britain to Union diplomatic efforts to block Confederate procurement efforts. A valuable book for students of the war at sea and the diplomatic struggle.

Ironclad of the Roanoke: Gilbert Elliot’s Albemarle, by Robert G. Elliot. Shippensburg, Pa.: White Mane Publishing, 2005. Pp. xxii, 372+. Illus., maps, append., notes, biblio., index. \$24.95 paper. ISBN: 1-57249-374-7.

A very complete treatment of the Confederate ironclad gunboat *Albemarle*, which played an important role in the defense of the Carolina sounds. The book provides a look at Confederate ironclad policy and its impact on the war. There is a good deal of interesting material on the improvisations necessary to design and build ironclads in the absence of a strong industrial base and a shortage of skilled workers. The ship’s career is treated at length, using many first-hand accounts interwoven in the narrative, with a particularly fine section on the ship’s loss, in a “commando raid” by USN Lt. William B. Cushing. Cushing is only one of several interesting characters who populate the book, including, of course, Gilbert Elliot, who is as much the subject of this book as the ship he built. Originally published about a decade ago, this edition of *Ironclad of the Roanoke* has been revised and includes additional illustrations.

Naval Campaigns of the Civil War, by Paul Calore. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Co., 2002. Pp. vii, 232. Illus., maps, gloss., biblio., index. \$35.00 paper. ISBN: 0-7864-1217-4.

An excellent concise overview of the maritime and riverine side of the Civil War. Calore, a former defense department professional, opens with a look at the naval situation at the start of the war, and then looks into the respective naval forces as they developed during the war, before taking up the campaigns of the war in more or less chronological order. The focus is on the operations and their effect on the war, rather than on technical innovations, bureaucratic developments, or the intricacies of wartime diplomacy as the Confederacy sought to secure warships and supplies in Europe, while the Union sought to deny it this option. These are noted in passing, but the real meat of the work is its treatment of operations which is excellent. There’s much fight here, and a look at the influence that the navies had on the ways in which the war unfolded. A good introduction for anyone unfamiliar with the wet side of the war.

Reminder

Nominations are in order for
*the Arthur Goodzeit and the
Civil War Book Awards.*

People

War’s Relentless Hand: Twelve Tales of Civil War Soldiers, by Mark H. Dunkelman. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2006. Pp. xiii, 288. Illus., notes, biblio., index. \$34.95. ISBN: 0-8071-3190-3.

War’s Relentless Hand provides the reader with short biographies of a dozen soldiers who served in the 154th New York, from the western part of the state, which was subject of the author’s previous work, *Brothers One and All: Esprit de Corps in a Civil War Regiment*. Tied together by their regional origins and common service in the regiment, each of the men had a very different war, and Dunkelman has pieced together those experiences, often working with very fragmentary evidence. He begins each tale at the man’s gravesite, then briefly outlines the available evidence before proceeding to tell the man’s story. And the stories are varied: a father worrying over his deathly-ill children, a soldier brutalized in a prisoner-of-war camp, a man who provided a substitute but died in the ranks anyway because of paperwork gone astray, and more. A valuable read for anyone interested in the life of the common soldier in the war.

John Tyler, the Accidental President, by Edward P. Crapol. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006. Pp. 332. Illus., map, biblio, index. \$37.50. ISBN: 0-8078-3041-0.

John Tyler, the first vice-president to succeed to the presidency when William Henry Harrison died within weeks of his inauguration in 1841, had indirect and direct connections to the great national struggle, and Crapol helps elucidate these. Examining Tyler's views on slavery, he notes that they were complex, but perhaps common among members of his class, combining personal reservations about slavery, but defending and prospering from it. Crapol delves into a number of controversies of Tyler presidency. Thus, while many people believed Tyler favored pro-slavery men in his political appointments, his record was more nuanced. Tyler worked to annex Texas, accomplished in the final days of his administration, and helping ignite war with Mexico, and supported foreign expansion, notably into the Caribbean, both of which helped fuel the rising tension over slavery. In addition, the author argues, Tyler set several important precedents as president which are still of importance today. The book concludes with a look at Tyler's role in the secession crisis; in February 1861 he chaired the "Washington Peace Conference" but afterwards then openly embraced secession, the only one of the five living former president (Tyler plus Van Buren, Fillmore, Pierce, and Buchanan), to do so, and at the time of his death had been elected to the Confederate Senate. A good book about an obscure, but important president.

The Cherokee Nation in the Civil War, by Clarissa W. Confer. Norman, Ok.: University of Oklahoma Press, 2007. Pp. xii, 199. Illus., maps, notes, biblio., index. \$24.95. ISBN: 978-0861-3803-9.

The Civil War rent asunder several of the Indian nations, in addition to the United States, chief among them the Cherokee, one of the "Five Civilized Tribes" that had been forcibly removed from the South to Oklahoma a generation earlier. Like several other tribes, the Cherokee were slaveholding, and under strong pressure from the secessionist states, ultimately threw in their lot with the Confederacy. But not all agreed. This led to civil war among the Cherokee, a struggle that matched in viciousness the larger war around them. This work examines that struggle through five broad themes, the historical, social, and political context within which the Cherokee acted, the politics of war, the war in the Indian Territory, the role of the Cherokee in the war, on the home front as well as the fighting front, and the resulting human, social, cultural, economic, and political dislocation that affected the tribe during and after the war. A valuable book for anyone interested in the social and political aspects of the war, Native Americans in the war, and the guerrilla side of the war.

Campaigns

Sherman Invades Georgia, by John R. Scales. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 2006. Pp. xix, 213. Illus., maps, tables, append., notes, biblio., index. \$34.95. ISBN: 1-59114-815-4.

In *Sherman Invades Georgia*, the author, a former special operations officer, attempts to use the modern military analytical methods to study the Georgia campaign. After several chapters that serve to introduce the Civil War way of war and the military situation as it stood on the eve of Sherman's Georgia campaign, there is a series of chapters that take us through an analysis of the situation using modern tools, but limited to the information available to Sherman's staff – "Mission," "Considerations," "Enemy Capabilities," and so forth, on to "Decision and Concept of Operations." The work makes extensive use of maps, plans, and tables, to help illustrate the analytical process, and actually includes work sheets so that the reader can try his hand at campaign planning. The work wraps up with a chapters dealing with "Ground Truth," that is, the situation based on what is known now, and then a review of what did happen, and some conclusions. Although Scales fails to provide a look at how Sherman's staff would actually have handled analysis and planning for a campaign, *Sherman Invades Georgia* will nevertheless be of value to anyone interested in the campaigns of the Civil War and may be of considerable use in training modern military officers to understand the Civil War and the tools of modern military planning.

The Shenandoah Valley Campaign of 1862, edited by Gary W. Gallagher. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003. Pp. xii, 255. Illus., maps, notes, biblio., index. \$34.95. ISBN: 0-8078-2786-X.

Part of the series "Military Campaigns of the Civil War," focused on Jackson's operations in the Valley in 1862. Because these events have been heavily studied already, the book is rather shorter than most of the others in the series. It is also less comprehensive. But it does manage to provide some interesting glimpses into the events and personalities, as well as some of the less-well covered aspects of the campaigns. There are eight essays in the volume by such scholars as Gallagher himself, Robert Krick, and others. Of particular value are an essay on Jackson's rather inept opponents by William J. Miller, and one by A. Cash Koeniger on Jackson's testy relations with many of his subordinates. Other essays look at Lincoln's role in the campaign, the effect of operations on the civilian population, Turner Ashby, and more. A good read for anyone interested in the Valley Campaign.

The Shenandoah Valley Campaign of 1864, edited by Gary W. Gallagher. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006. Pp. ix, 416. Illus., maps, notes, biblio., index. \$45.00. ISBN: 0-8078-3005-4.

While the Valley Campaign of 1862 has received considerable scholarly attention, that of 1864 has been much less studied. Thus Gary Gallagher's *The Shenandoah Valley Campaign of 1864*, the final volume in his series "Military Campaigns of the Civil War," is not only a good deal longer than that on the early campaign, but is also in many ways much more interesting and useful. The work consists of eleven essays on military operations in the Shenandoah Valley during 1864. These began in May, with a rather successful Confederate attempt at a strategic diversion, threatening Washington so as to relieve pressure on Lee's Army of Northern Virginia, and ended in the utter devastation of the Valley by the end of Autumn. Gallagher's own comparative look at the reputations, personalities, careers, and performance of the two most prominent commanders, Jubal Early and Phil Sheridan, is quite valuable. Among the other essays are discussions of Union generals Horatio G. Wright and Charles Russell Lowell, of the experiences and perceptions of Confederate civilians and of Confederate soldiers during the campaign, the implications of the campaign for the presidential elections. One interesting essay discusses the destruction that was actually inflicted on the Valley, concluding that popular and even scholarly views have tended to exaggerate its extent. The book unfortunately lacks a degree of balance, (e.g., there's no treatment of Union soldiers to match that of Confederates, or of Confederate generals to match those of Wright and Lowell).. Nevertheless, it will be of value to any student of the Civil War.

Regimentals

August Willich's Gallant Dutchmen: Civil War Letters from the 32nd Indiana Infantry, translated and edited by Joseph R. Reinhart. Kent, Oh.: Kent State University Press, 2006. Pp. xiii, 262. Illus., maps, append., notes, biblio., index. \$35.00. ISBN: 0-87338-862-3.

As the editor points out, missives found in most published collections of letters from Civil War soldiers are usually penned by American-born, English-speaking men. This thus omits the writings of the numerous foreign born troops who were not comfortable in English. Compiled from the soldiers' letters published in German-language newspapers, *August Willich's Gallant Dutchmen* allows some of these troops to be heard. The letters are arranged chronologically

in a series of chapters that follows the 32nd Indiana (the "1st German Infantry") from its formation in the summer of 1861 until it mustered out three years later. They cover all aspects of soldiering, include many battle pieces, soldier life, opinion, gossip, and more. A useful look at the war from the perspective of the immigrant volunteer.

History of the 90th Ohio Volunteer Infantry in the War of the Great Rebellion in the United States, 1861 to 1865, by Henry O. Harden. Kent, Oh.: Kent State University Press, 2006. Pp. x, 341. Illus., append. \$24.95 paper. ISBN: 0-87338-884-4.

A facsimile edition of a work by a veteran of the 90th Ohio originally published in 1902. In one sense, this is not really much of a history, that is, a weighing of contradictory evidence to elucidate events. But that's not the point. This is about the regiment. Harden, a journalist, drew upon letters, diaries, memoirs, and official documents to help his comrades, in their waning years, preserve *their* story of the Civil War and pass it on to their children. The book follows the regiment from its formation in 1862 to the end of the war, literally on a daily basis, as it marched and fought from Stone's River to Chickamauga to Atlanta, Franklin, and Nashville. There are a lot of personal anecdotes, whole letters from soldiers and veterans, poetry, and more. Perhaps not great literature, the book does, however, give the reader some idea of what the war looked like from the perspective of the ordinary soldier in the western armies.

From Home Guards to Heroes: The 87th Pennsylvania and its Civil War Community, by Dennis W. Brandt. Columbia, Mo.: University of Missouri Press, 2006. Pp. xxiv, 274. Illus., maps, tables, append., notes, biblio., index. \$42.50. ISBN: 0-8262-1680-9.

Raised largely from York County, in southeastern Pennsylvania, with one company from nearby Adams County, where Gettysburg lies, the 87th Pennsylvania was intended to provide security for railroads along the Mason-Dixon line. But in 1864 it joined the Army of the Potomac, and fought in the Overland Campaign, fought at Monocacy, and took part in Sheridan's Valley Campaign. The regiment's story is well told in *From Home Guards to Heroes*, which includes a look at the post-war veterans' experience. But the book tells more. The author also provides an economic and social profile of the men who served. Overall, they were a rather prosperous group of men, though some had an unsavory side, based on courtroom documents. Topping this off, the work delves into the communities from which the regiment was recruited, so that the reader gets a look at

local history and economy, social and cultural values, including a deep anti-slavery streak, and more. An unusually interesting regimental account.

Other

Lee & His Army in Confederate History, by Gary W. Gallagher. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001. Pp. xviii, 295. Illus., maps, notes, biblio., index. \$19.95 paper. ISBN: 0-80785-769-6.

A collection of eight essays by Gallagher that touch upon the image and impact of Robert E. Lee and the Army of Northern Virginia on the Confederacy, the war, and the Lost Cause Myth. The essays are divided into three groups. “Lee’s Campaigns” deals not with the actual operations, but rather with the way the leaders and people of the Confederacy perceived them. As this was often very different from the perception by the North, these are quite interesting contributions to the literature. “Lee as a Confederate General” takes a look at the Lee’s approach to war, which Gallagher argues was less “old fashioned” has been suggested by some critics. The final section, “Lee and His Army in the Lost Cause” consists of but one essay, which deals with the evolution of the “Marble Man” myth, from Lee himself through Jubal Early and on to Douglas Southall Freeman. In all, a very valuable work.

Confederate Heroines: 120 Southern Women Convicted by Union Military Justice, by Thomas P. Lowry. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2006. Pp. xvii, 212. Illus., append., notes, biblio., index. \$29.95. ISBN: 0-8071-2990-9.

Having plowed through c. 80,000 documents from U.S. military courts and tribunals, Lowry, already noted for excellent work in often obscure aspects of the Civil War, such as the sex life of the troops, has produced a study of 120 Southern women who for various reasons ran afoul of Union military authorities. He begins the book with a short, but excellent discussion of the roles ascribed to women by American society in the period. Then he goes on to discuss women’s roles in supporting the war, and then gets into his case studies. By his estimate, the 120 women in the book are probably about half of all women convicted by Union military courts. Their crimes included espionage, smuggling, cutting telegraph wires, flag desecration, abetting P/Ws or deserters to escape, and more, including murder, prostitution, and selling booze illegally (obviously “heroine” is applied loosely here). Where he can, Lowry gives us a good picture of the women involved, providing some ideas as to their motivations and experiences. Rather than go over familiar ground, he deliberately passes

over several more famous women who had run-ins with Union military authorities, such as Rose O’Neal Greenhow and Belle Boyd, to give us a lot of fresh faces and untold stories.

A Separate Civil War: Communities in Conflict in the Mountain South, by Jonathan Dean Sarris. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2006. Pp. x, 238. Illus., map, notes, biblio., index. \$22.50 paper. ISBN: 0-8139-2555-X.

Based on a very rich vein of diaries, letters, memoirs, and other documentation, *A Separate Civil War* is the story of the Confederate “home front” in Fannin and Lumpkin counties, in the Blue Ridge Mountains of Georgia close upon North Carolina and Tennessee. In *ante bellum* times a region of small holders and gold miners, at the start of the Civil War the region was strongly divided in sentiment, riven along lines of religion, race, and class, but perhaps most importantly, these divisions reflected local economic, social, and political issues. The result was an increasingly bitter civil war within the Civil War, as some local residents resisted the imposition of Confederate authority, while others supported it. The book doesn’t end at the close of the war. The author goes on to explore the ways in which the internal rifts in the region were smoothed over in the post war period through the creation of a commonly acceptable, if sanitized group memory. An excellent book, for the serious student.

More Generals in Gray: A Companion Volume to Generals in Gray, by Bruce S. Allardice. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2006. Pp. xv, 301. Illus., append, notes, biblio. \$22.95 paper. ISBN: 0-8071-3148-2.

Originally published in hardcover a decade ago, *More Generals in Gray* is dedicated to the late Ezra Warner, author of *Generals in Gray*, the invaluable guide to Confederate Army generals. As the subtitle implies, it does not supplant Warner’s work, but supplements it. Included are 137 men for whom documentation of appointment is less clear. These were officers for whom appointments were never confirmed by, or even submitted to, the Senate, or who were appointed but then “demoted” before senatorial action, or men officially “assigned to duty as a general” by Kirby Smith in the Western Theater and by some other commanders. In addition, there were a number of men who held commissions as generals from the various states prior to the formation of the Confederacy, such as Jefferson Davis himself, who was briefly Commanding General of the Mississippi Army before becoming president, and militia generals called into Confederate service. A very useful work.

America's Fortress: A History of Fort Jefferson, Dry Tortugas, Florida, by Thomas Reid. Gainesville, Fla.: University Press of Florida, 2006. Pp. xii, 163. Illus., plans, append, notes, biblio, index. \$24.95. ISBN: 0-8130-3019-6.

The account of the planning and construction of the great fort on the largest key in the Dry Tortugas, part of the elaborate coast defense system initiated following the War of 1812 which continued well into the twentieth century, actually forms only a small, though quite interesting part of *America's Fortress*. The real story is that of Fort Jefferson during and immediately after the Civil War. It is on the years 1860-1868 that the author has, quite correctly, focused his account. In this period, the fort served both to anchor the Union authority in the Gulf of Mexico and also as a prison for Confederates troops, agents, and sympathizers. The most famous of these was Dr. Samuel Mudd, implicated in the assassination of Abraham Lincoln. A useful book for anyone interested in America's coast defenses or in the Civil War.

Reminder

Annual dues are \$35.00,
payable in September

Lincoln

Lincoln the Lawyer, by Brian Dirck. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2006. Pp. xiv, 208+. Notes, bibliog., index. \$29.95. ISBN: 0-252-03181-6.

Observing that almost every aspect of Lincoln's life has been examined in often painful detail *except* his career as a lawyer, the author sets out of do precisely that. The result is an excellent look at what was, after all, the principal focus of Lincoln's life for a quarter of a century, the law. There are a lot of surprises here. Based on a sifting of thousands of documents drawn from all over the country by the "Lincoln Law Project," Dirck, author of *Lincoln and Davis: Imagining America, 1809-1865*, provides a picture of Lincoln's practice that is generally quite different from the often casual references to it in earlier literature. For examples, the vast majority of his cases involved not great issues of rights and justice or complex matters involving the Illinois Central Railroad, but mundane lawsuits over debts, often as attorney for the plaintiff. To be sure there were some criminal cases and some railroad work, but these were a relative handful of the 4,000 or so cases in which Lincoln had a hand. The picture that emerges is of a hard working, thoroughly professional attorney with a good sense of theater (Lincoln seems to have often varied his clothing to influence the perception of the court), with a

very modern sense of legal ethics, which led him to take cases that might be considered unsavory. In the process, we also learn a great deal about American society in the *ante bellum* period, particularly in "west", about the evolution of the law profession in the nineteenth century, and about the forces that shaped Lincoln's approach to government. There is surprising flaw in the book. Although he occasionally mentions Lincoln having trouble collecting his fees, and even having to resort to legal action in some cases, for some reason, Dirck fails to look at the business side of lawyering. So we learn little about Lincoln's income and business expenses, nor how he fared compared with other attorneys of the time. Despite this, however, *Lincoln the Lawyer* will be of value to anyone interested in Lincoln.

Abraham Lincoln, President-Elect: The Four Critical Months from Election to Inauguration, by Larry D. Mansch. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland, 2005. Pp. x, 228. Illus., map, notes, biblio., index. \$45.00. ISBN: 0-7864-2026-1.

While scholarship on the Civil War is rather voluminous, there is a curious shortage of works dealing with the period between the election of November 1860 and Lincoln's assumption of the presidency, some four months later. It is this lacuna that *Abraham Lincoln, President-Elect* seeks to fill. The focus of the work, naturally, is on Lincoln and his activities and actions during this critical period, which saw seven states declare themselves no longer part of the Union, but of a new entity, the Confederate States of America. The work follows Lincoln as he works on his cabinet selections, travels to Washington, and, finally, takes the oath of office on March 4, 1861. At the same time, the book gives us an overview of developments elsewhere; the spread of secession, the formation of the Confederacy, with the movements and activities of Jefferson Davis thrown in, and the actions of Pres. James Buchanan in response to the unfolding crisis. Mansch is of particular interest in terms of his treatment of the ways in which Lincoln and Buchanan reacted to secession. Buchanan has generally been criticized for "inaction" during the crisis. Mansch points out, however, that Buchanan took a public stand against secession and took several steps to preserve the authority of the Federal government, but tried to avoid making the situation worse, which could have compromised Lincoln's ability to deal with the crisis. Similarly, Lincoln has been criticized for not speaking out forcefully during this period, despite making a number of public speeches and "on the record" comments in the course of his 12-day journey from Illinois to Washington. Mansch demonstrates that Lincoln continually

reiterated his essentially conservative position on slavery, and his commitment to the preservation of the Union, while similarly trying not to say anything that would worsen the situation. An excellent read for anyone with an interest in the Civil War.

Review Essay: Women in the War
by C. Kay Larson

In last several years, three solid treatments of women who served in nontraditional roles during the Civil War have been published. Along with a few earlier efforts, these follow on Richard Hall's and my articles in *MINERVA: Quarterly Report on Women and the Military* in the early 1990s.

- *Women on the Civil War Battlefield*, by Richard H. Hall. Lawrence, Ks.: University Press of Kansas, 2006, Pp. 396. Illus., append., notes, biblio., index.
- *They Fought Like Demons: Women Soldiers of the Civil War*, by De Anne Blanton & Lauren M. Cook. New York: Random House, 2002. Pp. 277. Illus., notes, biblio., index.
- *All the Daring of a Soldier: Women of the Civil War Armies*, by Elizabeth D. Leonard. New York: Norton, 1999. Pp. 320. Illus., notes, biblio., index.

All three books being reviewed are excellent works. However, the authors all cover much the same territory, that is, the most outstanding women who served in the Union or Confederate armies. The two most famous are S. Emma E. Edmonds, a.k.a., Pvt. Franklin Thompson, of the 2nd Michigan, and Loreta Janeta Velazquez, a.k.a., Lt. Harry T. Buford, CSA. Both women published autobiographies, unfortunately with fictionalized portions. This leaves researchers the daunting task of uncovering the real truth of their service.

Other famous women covered include: Dr. Mary Walker, assistant surgeon of the 52nd Ohio, the only woman Medal of Honor awardee; Annie Etheridge, daughter of the 5th Michigan Infantry, a Kearny Cross awardee; Pauline Cushman, scout of the Army of the Cumberland; Jennie Rodgers of the 95th Illinois; Harriet Tubman, U.S. scout leader; Amy Clarke of several Union regiments; Malinda Blalock of the 26th North Carolina; Kady Brownell of the 1st Rhode Island; spies Belle Boyd, Antonia Ford, and Rose O'Neal Greenhow. Many women combatants were discovered when they came wounded into hospitals. One lieutenant, who is believed to have been Velazquez, made the mistake of curtseying as she left a Richmond government office. Most women seemed to have joined to be with their husbands or boyfriends. Some women buried others and swore to keep their secrets. The authors all sought to feature

the most comprehensive treatment of these women, and often uncovered new material about them.

Obviously, the authors being more or less competing with each another, much duplication results. So the reader is deluged by biographical information on over 200 women combatants. But the books do vary in a number of ways.

Blanton and Cook concentrate on themes, such as what motivated the women to enlist, how they acquitted themselves in battle, *etc.* So often, one woman is discussed in more than one chapter, making it difficult to keep them straight. Leonard's principal original contribution is to have dug through the official records to unearth material on women performing "paramilitary" duties; spies, scouts, detectives, and so forth. In Hall extends his subject to include women who served as nurses under fire, spies, scouts, and saboteurs. Unfortunately, none of the authors adequately cover women who served as doctors or in naval operations (on which I did an article in the Summer 1992 *MINERVA*).

Those seeking complete information about this pantheon of heroines, should read all three books. For the general, not-yet-initiated reader, Hall's *Women on the Civil War Battlefield* is the most satisfying. Author of the earlier *Patriots in Disguise* (1993), covering the most notable women combatants, in this new book Hall limits his treatment in the main text to a small number of notable women, and covers many more with brief sketches in an "Honor Roll," thus not overwhelming the reader with biographical detail. Given the additional roles he discusses, the reader can also better appreciate the range of activities in which the women engaged. Often, women carried out more than one role. Mrs. Mary A. Ellis, who with her husband helped raise the 1st Missouri Cavalry (U.S.), also nursed the wounded, assisted with operations, and served as a courier and detective.

Although a little out of sync with the rest of Hall's text, a chapter by Grace Fleming, an African-American historian, is of value. She treats the roles blacks played in intelligence operations and in generally assisting Union troops. In his final section, Hall reprints some contemporary accounts of some of the women covered in the book, giving readers a subjective impression of their media treatment. As a fan of documentary histories, I found this a unique addition; tone, verbiage, and subjective impressions are important to understanding any topic.

All four authors should be highly commended for their fine efforts as these works took years of assiduous, painstaking research.

Membership News

Congratulations are in order to veteran NYMAS Board Member *Arnold Albert*, who has recently been granted a brevet promotion to brigadier general in the New York Guard on the State Retired List. He was also awarded the NY State Medal for conspicuous service by Governor Pataki last fall. This is the highest state military award.

Board Member Maria Doti was given the rank of Major in the NY Guard.

NYMAS Board Member, *C. Kay Larson*, was the featured speaker at the Twin Cities Civil War Roundtable on January 16, 2007, in Minneapolis. She gave an overview of her 2004 book: *Great Necessities: The Life, Times, and Writings of*

Anna Ella Carroll, 1815-1894; Carroll was a political/legal advisor to Abraham Lincoln, as well as a military secret agent. Kay also has announced the publication of her latest Civil War work, *South Under a Prairie Sky: The Journal of Nell Churchill, U.S. Army Nurse & Scout*. (\$31.00 cloth, ISBN 1-4257-3891-5; \$21.00 paper, ISBN 1-4257-3890-7). This work of fiction is a fact-based account, sourced from Larson's family and local Illinois history biographies of nurses & female scouts, memoirs, and official war records, along with other journals, letters, and histories.

On March 7th, Board Member *Al Nofi*, gave a talk on "History and Game Design" as part of a program on "Strategy and Strategic Theory" at the University of Texas at Austin.

Neil Graham

1940 – 2007

One of NYMAS' most faithful attendees, Neil Graham, passed away Saturday, April 21. Neil was an Army veteran, graduate of Pace University and recently delivered several lectures on Islamic history to NYMAS. Board Member Frank Radford said, "Neil's death has been so sudden some of us, including me, have yet to grasp what we've truly lost. Neil was a good man and a wise one - a very rare phenomenon."

Remainder of the Spring 2007

NYMAS Schedule

- May 4 "Army Life in 7th Century China," David Graff, The Chinese Military History Society
- May 11 "Irregular Warfare on the Revolutionary Frontier," Glenn F. Williams, U.S. Army Center of Military History
- May 18 "The Death of a City: The Athenian Destruction of Melos in 416 B.C.," Francis Phillip Varney, Cornell University
- May 25 "American 'Indian Wars' and their Relevance to the 21st Century, Donald F. Bittner, US Marine Corps Command & Staff College
- June 1, "The Greatest Generation Comes Home: The Veteran in American Society," Michael D. Gambone, Kutztown University
- June 8 "The *Mary Carver* Affair: United States' Foreign Policy and the Africa Squadron, 1841 – 1845," Amy Van Natter, CUNY Graduate Center

- June 15 "*Viva Villa!*: The Politics and History of the Punitive Expedition into Mexico, 1916," Jim Dingeman, NYMAS/INN
- June 22 "Thwarting a Confederate Coup D'etat, Washington, D. C., April 1861," C. Kay Larson, NYMAS

NYMAS talks are open to the public and free. They are normally held on Friday evenings at the City University of New York Graduate Center, at 365 Fifth Avenue between 34th and 35th Streets from 7:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. Friday lectures are usually held on the 6th floor in Room 6-495, but confirmation of the room number should be obtained from the security desk in the building lobby.

These talks are sponsored by the New York Military Affairs Symposium in conjunction with CUNY's Conference on History and Politics, Dr. George D. Schwab, Director. NYMAS is associated with the Society for Military History, Region 2.

Speakers and subjects may be subject to change without notice. A current schedule is available at the NYMAS website at <http://nymas.org>.

The New York Military Affairs Symposium

CUNY Graduate Center
c/o History Department, Room 5114
365 Fifth Avenue
New York, N.Y., 10016

NYMAS is a tax exempt, not-for-profit membership corporation chartered under the laws of the State of New York. Donations are deductible from both Federal and New York State taxes. Membership dues are \$35.00 a year, payable in September. Checks should be made out to "NYMAS" and mailed to the CUNY address. Items for *The Review* should be sent to Al Nofi via email to anofi@nymas.org.